

stead of the rhythmically preferable *Eufrates*. She wisely omits the orthographic accent on *diafana* (15f), reading it as paroxytone ("por la diafana claror de los cantos"), but accents *Trión* in 8c where *Trion* better fits the rhythm: "mira el Trión que ha por deporte." She might have done well to retain the reading of *non le* from her base MS (attested by other witnesses) in 14d, "la presa que bien non le finche la mano," rather than emending to *no-l*, which renders the line unscannable. An even bolder step would have been to show the shifted stress in more common words: Mena must have accented *firmez* in 2c, e.g.: N. knows this, but does not edit accordingly. There are other examples, but even in the aggregate they amount to a minor quibble, and should not cast a negative pall over an excellent piece of editing.

For Mena's other works, N. follows existing editions: Pérez Priego (1989) for the *Coronación* and its commentary, Rivera (1982) for the *Coplas de los pecados mortales*, and her own (1988) for the minor poems.

The volume has an attractive format and is remarkably easy to navigate. There are two sets of notes to the text: the footnotes (generally brief) give essential lexical meanings, explain literary and historical allusions, note significant variant readings, and point out stylistic devices; more extensive commentary is reserved for the generous endnotes (239-306), with symbols in the footnotes to alert the readers to the existence of an entry in the endnotes or apparatus should they wish to consult them. The end bibliography is quite complete, though not exhaustive, and the index to the notes by key word gives entrée to all discussions of an item (*anacoluto*, e.g., figures in seventeen notes, *Febo* in three).

Credit is due the translators, Margarita Jiménez and María Teresa Cabello, for their elegant work on the notes and prologue, respectively, and to all involved for the high quality of the final product. Only S.'s preliminary study could have benefitted from further editorial *toilette*. Mena's date of death appears as 1454, not once but three times, and six lines from page xiii are repeated almost verbatim on page xxx.

Philip O. Gericke

University of California, Riverside

Works Cited

- Kerkhof, Maxim P.A.M. "Hacia una nueva edición crítica del *Laberinto de Fortuna* de Juan de Mena". *Journal of Hispanic Philology* 7 (1982-83): 179-89.
- Lázaro Carreter, Fernando. "La poética del arte mayor castellano". *Studia Hispanica in honorem R. Lapesa*. Vol. 1. Madrid: Gredos-Seminario Menéndez Pidal, 1972. 343-78.
- Lida de Malkiel, María Rosa. *Juan de Mena, poeta del prerrenacimiento español*. México, D.F.: Colegio de México, 1950.
- Mena, Juan de. *Obras completas*. Ed. Miguel Ángel Pérez Priego. Barcelona: Planeta, 1989.
- . *Poesie minori*. Ed. Carla De Nigris. Naples: Ligouri, 1988.
- . "*Coplas de los siete pecados mortales*" and *First Continuation*. Ed. Gladys M. Nigro. Vol. 1. Madrid: Porrua Turanzas, 1989.

Menocal, María Rosa. *Shards of Love: Exile and the Origins of the Lyric*. Durham and London: Duke UP, 1994. 295 pages. ISBN 0-8223-1419-3

This is a magical book. Menocal draws her readers into a world in which Jim Morrison and Petrarch, the medieval and the postmodern, Latin America and medieval Iberia, Dante and Eric Auerbach, Nicolás Guillén and the poets of the *muwashshahāt*, and Eric Clapton and Majnun (the fictional mad lover of a medieval Persian tale) are different manifestations of the same phenomenon. This is the world of the lyric: synchronistic, pluralistic, bizarre, irrational, chaotic and fragmented, and after entering the reader is convinced of the perfect naturalness of these seemingly incongruous equations. Menocal's prose is lyrical as well. It is free of jargon, peppered with metaphors and sensuous, vivid images, and enviable in its suggestiveness.

The thesis of the book is that lyric is born in exile. But here the concepts "lyric" and "exile" have a broader than usual range of meaning. For example, Menocal shows how Dante, exiled from Florence, composes the lyrical *De vulgari eloquentia*, which celebrates and legitimizes the exiled lyric poetry of the vernacular languages. Dante's exile is geographic and literal. The exile of the poetry is figurative: by willfully rebelling against the accepted, classical canon, it has imposed upon itself a linguistic and cultural homelessness. Dante's *De vulgari* is lyrical in that it embraces the marginal, respects no linguistic or national borders, and flies in the face of the "Great Tradition". The songs Dante gathers together also bear all the signs of defense and retreat characteristic of the love lyric of exile.

The heirs to Dante's project are the practitioners of Romance philology at its inclusive, pluralistic, anachronic, lyrical best. Leo Spitzer, exiled in 1933 from his teaching post at Cologne, moves to Istanbul and later to the United States. His *A Method of Interpreting Literature* offers analyses of John Donne, St. John of the Cross, Richard Wagner, Voltaire, and American advertising. Eric Auerbach, who followed Spitzer into exile from Germany to Istanbul in the late 1930's, writes *Mimesis*, in which Homer, Goethe, Schiller, Old French, Cervantes, and Virginia Woolf cohabit. Ezra Pound's *The Spirit of Romance* is similarly "lyrical and synchronistic", and in it "the present is a living part of the past" (116). Pound later exiles himself to Europe, where his literary activities closely parallel Dante's: he collects and edits modernist poetry, the lyric in exile of his time.

What one cannot avoid observing, and what Menocal stresses repeatedly, is the political nature of this type of philological enterprise. In the context of *Shards of Love*, it is no coincidence that Dante, Auerbach and Spitzer depart from the nationalistic perspective on language and literature in the politically charged times during which they write. What better way to combat the powers that be than to challenge the fundamental institution with which the enemy identifies: the nation as defined by a distinctive language and culture. Dante challenges the Classical Latin canon, and Auerbach and Spitzer defy, even as they observe, the splintering of Europe into atomized warring nations. As opposed to the nationalistic model, the Romance philologist "begins with the premise that the universe has exploded and that its remnants are dispersed

everywhere and may appear at any time or place, in any language. And the philologist is a part of that diaspora, its historian, in exile, an exile" (109).

Menocal describes the totalizing, comprehensive, orderly force that opposes the lyric as "narrative". This force erases selectively as it creates an unbroken storyline from the lyrical shards. Narrative has lost many of the fragments in its totalizing efforts. People such as the speaker of Classical Arabic whom Christopher Columbus enlisted on his Western journey to the East, since that was the language he expected to encounter in any civilized corner of the world, and facts such as Ramon Llull's mastery of Classical Arabic have been swept under the carpet because to reveal them would be to acknowledge the cultural hybrid that was medieval Spain. It would interrupt the mythical straight line that "modern", post-1492 Western civilization likes to draw from Ancient Greece to contemporary times. In her 1987 *The Arabic Role in Medieval Literary History. A Forgotten Heritage*, Menocal discusses at length the values at stake that motivate this erasure. What *Shards of Love* adds is a series of poignant (Menocal's favorite adjective) examples.

One of the most brilliantly conceived cases of narrative's rewriting of a lyrical phenomenon is the example of mystical poetry. We have all been taught that mystics describe their experience of union with God in terms of the ecstasy of human love because the latter is an appropriate metaphor for the former. Menocal uses the writings of Ramon Llull to argue instead that mysticism is in its essence a fusion of loves and that the exegetical tradition of reading the love language as secondary to the spiritual meaning does a serious injustice to this poetry. In Llull, the irreconcilable contradictions are essential, and have as their source the paradoxical nature of 13th-century Iberian society. In the mystical lyric, "The act of hermeticism has a critical social dimension in its refusal of exegesis, since exegetical discourse, then and now, is the language of orthodox powers" (89). These pages carry strong implications for the works of San Juan de la Cruz, Teresa de Jesús and other later Iberian mystics.

Menocal's attempts to restore a lyrical ethos to narrative are delightfully exemplified by her own literary history making. Section I of *Shards of Love* is entitled "The Horse Latitudes", and opens with a Jim Morrison poem of the same title. Much later, when Morrison and his poetry resurface in the discussion of rock and roll as a lyric phenomenon, the appropriateness of the opening quotation becomes clear. Back in Section I, Menocal uses the image of tossing off the horses to propel ships stilled by lack of wind in the original context: Christopher Columbus's 1492 voyage. But later the horse latitudes become a metaphor for the historical jettisoning of details that disturb the smooth Columbus narrative, the grammatical comprehensibility of post-Nebrija Castilian. Columbus's history as we know it is a palimpsest in that much has been erased and rewritten. One example is that on the same day that Columbus initiated his voyage of discovery (August 2, 1492), thousands of Jews were beginning their voyage of exile from nearby ports. Other horses overboard include Bartolomé de las Casas's rewriting and smoothing out of Columbus's "irregular vernacular" and the larger project of the post-Renaissance rewriting of the medieval world. This latter process is one of the most fully-developed themes of *Shards of Love*. In a variety of contexts Menocal's arguments bear witness to the way in which the non-narratable, heterogeneous Middle Ages

become part of the modern, post-1492 "Master Narrative". The lyrical echoes and resonance of Section I's title reverberate throughout the book.

This enchanting lyric layering of "The Horse Latitudes" is typical of the experience of reading all of *Shards of Love*. First, one sees the cover, which reproduces the design from the record jacket of Derek and the Dominos's 1970 *Layla, and Other Assorted Love Songs*. The name Láyla appears intriguingly in the 13th-century Ibn 'Arabī song quoted on page 71, "Gentle Now Doves," but one must wait for "Chasing the Wind," chapter 3 of Section II, to discover the intricate connections between Eric Clapton, the Layla of the Arabic tradition, and the "exile" of the title. Menocal repeatedly establishes such masterful lyric coherence between apparently distant phenomena.

After a very personal Prelude relating many of the book's themes to its composition, Menocal organizes her study in four sections. The first two are extensive and contain subdivisions—four in Section I, "The Horse Latitudes", and three in Section II, "Scandal". Section III, entitled "Desire", is a scant, three-page, intensely lyrical revisiting of Dante, exile, doves, Llull, Majnun, Clapton, Auerbach, Provence, and the other major themes developed earlier. The final Section is a bibliographical essay, "Readings and Sources", which minimizes the need for distracting footnotes in the body of the text and offers many suggestions for further reading. This section contains a misreading of my 1991 *La corónica* study of the *kharjas*, which Menocal interprets as "a lament for the loss of 'authenticity' and all those other good primitive things that only women...can do in poetry" because she inaccurately attributes to me the ideas of other authors whom I criticize and contradict (265). My article is not central to Menocal's thesis, and I uncovered no such errors in her discussion of studies which are.

Shards of Love is necessary reading for anyone interested in the literature of the Middle Ages, lyric poetry, rock and roll, Christopher Columbus, mysticism, and Romance philology. This book offers the unprecedented intellectual stimulation of re-thinking completely and convincingly the standard narrative in all of these categories. And in addition, Menocal can write circles around the rest of us.

Mary Jane Kelley
Ohio University

Works Cited

- Menocal, María Rosa. *The Arabic Role in Medieval Literary History. A Forgotten Heritage*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 1987.
Kelley, Mary Jane. "Virgins Misconceived: Poetic Voice in the Mozarabic *Kharjas*." *La corónica* 19.2 (1991): 1-23.