

Title: Comitatus.

Published: [Los Angeles, Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies,
UCLA]

Description: v. ill. 23 cm.


Location: SML, Stacks, LC Classification

Call Number: PR251 C65

Status: 21 c.1 Checked out - Due 04/02/2005

Library has: 1(1970)-10(1980),
12(1981)-35(2004)

Subjects (Library of Congress):
English literature--Middle English, 1100-1500--History and
criticism--Periodicals.
English literature--Old English, ca. 450-1100--History and
criticism--Periodicals.



=====

+++++

Yale University Library
PO Box 208240
New Haven, CT 06520
<http://www.library.yale.edu>

Jews as "Jews" might be cause for a moment's hesitation and a passing comment. But, the distinctive role of Jews in Joachimite millennialism is central to Lerner's thesis. Given that this is the case, it would be of paramount importance to understand what the term "Jew" means, both to Joachim of Fiore for the purposes of his vision and to Lerner for the purposes of his historical analysis. Perhaps of greater concern is the revelation of the ongoing transparency of the Jews' ambiguous status, by this I mean the question of the idea of an indelible property inherent to the Jew. The issue goes beyond merely asking whether or not a Jew who converts to Christianity is still a Jew. Is it simply taken for granted that conversion still leaves something of the Jew behind, and that regardless of religious practice and affiliation the "Jew" remains? And why don't these questions arise for Lerner himself, particularly since he introduces his study with a condemnation of the systematic annihilation of Jews by a society that believed that Jewishness left an indelible stain, a tainting of the blood that conversion could not erase.

Lerner's insensitivity to the assumed inalienable nature of the Jew is even more troubling when he tries to determine why Joachim and his various followers would have been so favorably predisposed to Jews. Repeatedly Lerner considers the possibility of Jewish ancestry or actual exposure to Jews and Jewish culture as somehow explaining the constant "philo-Judaic" tendencies of these Joachimite "prophets." Was Joachim Jewish or of Jewish descent? Did some of these "prophets" have personal motivations for predicting Jewish rewards? "Could it have been that the special stance of the Saxon Franciscans toward Jews came about as a result of contacts with real Jews?" (96) It is difficult to determine what is more offensive: the idea that converted Jews living in union with Christians is a form of "special treatment" for Jews, or that a medieval Christian might find Jews tolerable only if he had some pragmatic reason for doing so.

Unfortunately, these issues get in the way of what might otherwise be a fairly interesting historical narrative. Joachim of Fiore's teachings do have a unique history of transmission, and the ways in which his prophetic teachings are interpreted and then reinterpreted could lead to enlightening investigations in the theological subcultures of medieval monastics. There is also a good deal of discussion about the relationship of millennial prophecies and papal politics here, and more detail in this area would make for good reading. The path Lerner chose in this case, however, proves more troubling than enlightening. If the term "Jew" used in a religious context designates something other than a religious affiliation, and if conversion to Christianity does not change the "Jew" to a Christian, then we have not been liberated from the "persecuting society," and we learned nothing from the horror of Treblinka.

CHERYL GOLDSTEIN, Comparative Literature, UCLA

The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature: The Literature of Al-Andalus, ed. María Rosa Menocal, Raymond P. Scheindlin, and Michael Sells (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001) ix + 507 pp., ill.

The idea of Al-Andalus (the Muslim-controlled territories of the Iberian Peninsula from the eighth to the fifteenth centuries) is a fascinating one for Westerners, often conjuring up images reminiscent of the *Tales of the Alhambra* or the

Arabian Nights. Al-Andalus is frequently described as of immense cultural production where members of the coexisted in an atmosphere of tolerance and pluralism, and where they apprehend the complicated reality behind the clichés, the need of a compass to help them navigate this little-known world. Indeed the topic of Al-Andalus is of interest to many historians, panists, historians of religion, and anyone interested in the complex historical relationships between Christianity, Islam, and Judaism. Important to making sense out of today's headlines. That it is helpful.

Though straightforward and clear, the title (*The Literature of Al-Andalus*) can be misleading since there are important sections on philosophy, and music. And though most of the tome deals with the history of the region, there is a three-chapter section dedicated to Sicily as European Arabic culture. The book's purview is not culture, either, but includes chapters on Christian authors (Gregory B. Stone²⁴), as well as Jewish writers such as Abraham ben Meir ben P. Scheindlin. This method is part of what the Hebraist, and a Romance scholar—refer to as "a truly comparative work that offers a radical new approach to the study of the Middle East" (dust jacket). It could also be called part of what Tova R. Muwashshah, describes as "the contemporary zeitgeist of deconstruction" that has overtaken the "purist philologist" of recent years, in search of a more irenic and less controversial Ibero-Arabic studies.

The twenty-six essay-chapters, each written by a different author, are ordered under headings or "parts." Part I, "The Shapes of Culture," is an introduction to a series of chapters that form a cultural "background" to the text: "Language," "Music," "Spaces," "Knowledge," and "Architecture." The early fascinating is Jerrilynn Dadds's discussion of the characterized architecture on the Peninsula. Her chapter on the situation of the Mozarabic Christians living under Muslim rule, for whom the "juggernaut of opulent, complex visual culture" of Córdoba meant the destruction of the descendants of the Visigoths (83). Yet these same Mozarabes were integrated into Christian-controlled territories in the north, but their architectural details borrowed from the mosques of the South were attributed to the work of the *mudéjares*, Muslims living in the region.

Part II is entitled "The Shapes of Literature" and introduces the basic forms of Andalusí literature: "The muwashshah" (a form of poetry that delighted in exalting themes such as love, and rhyming prose narratives known as "Maqama" (Rina, Beatrice Gruendler), odes addressed to a member of the ruling family).

Part III, "Andalusians," profiles a series of writers from the region.

²⁴Since the book is a collection of essays, I have indicated the authors in parentheses.

the cause for a moment's hesitation and a passing com-
 ve role of Jews in Joachite millennialism is central to
 that this is the case, it would be of paramount impor-
 at the term "Jew" means, both to Joachim of Fiore for
 on and to Lerner for the purposes of his historical analy-
 concern is the revelation of the ongoing transparency of
 tus, by this I mean the question of the idea of an indeli-
 the Jew. The issue goes beyond merely asking whether
 erts to Christianity is still a Jew. Is it simply taken for
 still leaves something of the Jew behind, and that re-
 ctice and affiliation the "Jew" remains? And why don't
 r Lerner himself, particularly since he introduces his
 on of the systematic annihilation of Jews by a society
 ness left an indelible stain, a tainting of the blood that
 se.

to the assumed inalienable nature of the Jew is even
 ries to determine why Joachim and his various follow-
 avorably predisposed to Jews. Repeatedly Lerner con-
 ewish ancestry or actual exposure to Jews and Jewish
 aining the constant "philo-Judaic" tendencies of these
 Joachim Jewish or of Jewish descent? Did some of
 ersonal motivations for predicting Jewish rewards?
 the special stance of the Saxon Franciscans toward
 ult of contacts with real Jews?" (96) It is difficult to
 ffensive: the idea that converted Jews living in union
 of "special treatment" for Jews, or that a medieval
 tolerable only if he had some pragmatic reason for

ues get in the way of what might otherwise be a
 l narrative. Joachim of Fiore's teachings do have a
 sion, and the ways in which his prophetic teachings
 interpreted could lead to enlightening investigations
 res of medieval monastics. There is also a good deal
 ationship of millennial prophecies and papal politics
 his area would make for good reading. The path
 owever, proves more troubling than enlightening. If
 eligious context designates something other than a
 onversion to Christianity does not change the "Jew"
 e not been liberated from the "persecuting society,"
 n the horror of Treblinka.

CHERYL GOLDSTEIN, Comparative Literature, UCLA

Arabic Literature: The Literature of Al-Andalus,
 , Raymond P. Scheindlin, and Michael Sells
 niversity Press, 2001) ix + 507 pp., ill.

Muslim-controlled territories of the Iberian Penin-
 fteenth centuries) is a fascinating one for Western-
 es reminiscent of the *Tales of the Alhambra* or the

Arabian Nights. Al-Andalus is frequently described as a sumptuous civilization
 of immense cultural production where members of the three Abrahamic faiths
 coexisted in an atmosphere of tolerance and pluralism. Whilst specialists com-
 prehend the complicated reality behind the clichés, non-experts are often in
 need of a compass to help them navigate this little-known but important world.
 Indeed the topic of Al-Andalus is of interest to many scholars: Islamists, His-
 panists, historians of religion, and anyone interested in understanding the com-
 plex historical relationships between Christianity, Islam, and Judaism so im-
 portant to making sense out of today's headlines. That is just where this volume
 is helpful.

Though straightforward and clear, the title (*The Literature of Al-Andalus*)
 can be misleading since there are important sections on architecture, philoso-
 phy, and music. And though most of the tome deals with the Iberian Peninsula,
 there is a three-chapter section dedicated to Sicily as an important center of
 European Arabic culture. The book's purview is not confined to Islamic litera-
 ture, either, but includes chapters on Christian authors such as Ramón Llull
 (Gregory B. Stone²⁴), as well as Jewish writers such as Moses Ibn Ezra (Ray-
 mond P. Scheindlin). This method is part of what the editors—an Arabist, a
 Hebraist, and a Romance scholar—refer to as "a truly interdisciplinary and
 comparative work that offers a radical new approach to the field" (from the
 dust jacket). It could also be called part of what Tova Rosen, in chapter 7, "The
 Muwashshah," describes as "the contemporary zeitgeist of postmodernism and
 deconstruction" that has overtaken the "purist philological approach" (185) in
 recent years, in search of a more irenic and less contentious attitude toward
 Ibero-Arabic studies.

The twenty-six essay-chapters, each written by a different scholar, are
 ordered under headings or "parts." Part I, "The Shapes of Culture," is an intro-
 duction to a series of chapters that form a cultural "background" to the rest of
 the text: "Language," "Music," "Spaces," "Knowledge," and "Love." Particu-
 larly fascinating is Jerrilynn Dodds's discussion of the web of influences that
 characterized architecture on the Peninsula. Her chapter begins with a glimpse
 into the situation of the Mozarabic Christians living under the Umayyad dy-
 nasty, for whom the "juggernaut of opulent, complex cosmopolitan literary and
 visual culture" of Córdoba meant the destruction of their historical identity as
 descendants of the Visigoths (83). Yet these same Mozarabs, once they immi-
 grated to Christian-controlled territories in the north, built churches with archi-
 tectural details borrowed from the mosques of the South, ornaments often at-
 tributed to the work of the *mudéjares*, Muslims living in Christian territories.

Part II is entitled "The Shapes of Literature" and introduces readers to three
 basic forms of Andalusí literature: "The muwashshah" (Tova Rosen), strophic
 poetry that delighted in exalting themes such as love, panegyric, and wine;
 rhyming prose narratives known as "Maqama" (Rina Drory); and "Qasida"
 (Beatrice Gruendler), odes addressed to a member of the elite.

Part III, "Andalusians," profiles a series of writers that emerged from the

²⁴Since the book is a collection of essays, I have indicated the author of each chapter in parentheses.

cultural milieu of Al-Andalus, from Ibn Hazm (Eric Ormsby), whose books were burnt in Al-Andalus after his death, but whom later Spanish readers like Ortega y Gasset paradoxically embraced as a "Muslim Don Quixote" (248), to Petrus Alfonsi (Lourdes María Álvarez), the Andalusian Jew converted to Christianity who passionately promoted Arabic science, to the Sufi writer Ibn 'Arabī (Alexander Knysh), not to mention the intriguingly complex Majorcan philosopher Ramón Llull (Gregory B. Stone).

Part IV, entitled "To Sicily," is an examination of the spirit of Arabic culture that existed long after the island had been captured by Christian armies. In chapter 22, "Michael Scot and the Translators," Thomas E. Burman looks at the important issue of translation as a vehicle that transferred Arabic culture to the Latin West through the lens of the fascinating figure of the medieval translator Michael Scot.²⁵ Best known by posterity for being condemned to the circle of the sorcerers in Dante's *Inferno* (Canto XX), Scot established his name as a translator of Arabic in Toledo at the beginning of the thirteenth century and passed his final years in the Sicilian court of Frederick II, where he found enthusiastic patronage. Though known for translations of alchemical and magical works that earned him his place in Dante's Hell, Scot was also instrumental in making the corpus of Aristotle's writings available to Western readers. Chapter 20, "Poetries of the Norman Courts," describes how, according to Karla Mallette, "Normans embraced Islamic ideas of government and Arabic culture with enthusiasm" (380).

Part V, "Marriages and Exiles," profiles Andalusian culture in reference to peoples defined in some way by a resistance to the dominant society surrounding them ("The Mozarabs" by Hanna E. Kassis, "The Arabized Jews" by Ross Brann, "The Moriscos" by Luce López-Baralt), or those defined by the nostalgia of a lost homeland ("The Sephardim" by Samuel G. Armistead). This last chapter, written by one of the greatest living experts on Sephardic ballad tradition, brings the discussion all the way down to the eighteenth century. Armistead describes this period as "the Golden Age of Judeo-Spanish literature" (459), and introduces the reader to the remarkable wealth of non-Hispanic influences that shaped Sephardic oral literature in exile.

The book ends with Part VI, "To Al-Andalus, Would She Return the Greeting." This is not a scholarly essay, but rather an English translation by Michael Sells of the *Nūnniya* (Poem in N) of Ibn Zaydūn, which communicates the sentiments of loss and lament that Muslims must have felt at the waning and defeat of the great society this book explores.

If there is a criticism to be made regarding this volume, it is that the editors sacrificed order in arrangement of the chapters so as to avoid compartmentalizing such a rich and multifaceted topic, a choice that may be disconcerting to those approaching the volume for the first time. That said, the bibliographies contained at the end of each chapter are extremely valuable and will aid the researcher new to the field in further investigations on each topic. Due to this and the other numerous merits of the essays in this collection, scholars in fields

²⁵Though his surname would indicate British origin, the chapter's author tells us that Scot's actual birthplace remains a mystery.

that in some way deal with the culture of Islamic *Al-Andalus* to be very helpful as a reference work on a subject that is significant, albeit little-known outside the United States.

DAMIAN BACICH, St. Louis

Lillian Ray Martin, *The Art and Archaeology of Venice* (College Station, TX: Texas A&M University Press, 1997, \$49.95, 288 pp., 100 b/w illus.).

In this wonderfully illustrated volume, the fifth in the series *Archaeology of Venice*, Lillian Ray Martin presents the date of all known medieval and Renaissance representations in and around the Veneto. Over the course of the introductory essay, the catalogue, and an analysis, the author answers a range of archaeological questions about the design of Venetian watercraft. This is a particularly useful reviewer's point of view, because although it is based on a study of early modern Venetian ships, as the author acknowledges, it is a fundamental work of Giovanni Casoni (1847, 1973), Marco Bonino (1978), and Alvise Chiggaia (1997), an archaeological work that utilizes a wealth of visual evidence, including steering mechanisms, and superstructure into the Venetian ship.

Martin devotes the first chapter to an introductory overview of Venetian art. This opening chapter is divided into subheadings that provide a summary of significant political events and naval history, as an overview of Venetian art and a discussion of the themes. Of particular interest is the discussion of the Venetian ship, which were invented between 1250 and 1300, such as the pulley, which increased Venetian trade activity by allowing for faster and safer shipping. It should be noted that some of these sections are clearly meant to acquaint the reader with aspects of Venetian history, others have a more useful focus on artistic techniques, for example, does not only when one nearly finishes the book that one can find a description of the artistic techniques employed to produce the Venetian ship catalogue. It is never explicitly stated. As a result, the somewhat disjointed assemblage of topics unrelated to the Venetian ship comes later.

The primary contribution of this book lies in the second chapter, where Martin has pulled together 129 illustrations of Venetian ships and boats drawn from the early fourteenth century. Compiled from mosaics, enamels, woodblock prints, frescoes, paintings, sculpture, prints and engravings, the catalogue demonstrates the author's meticulous methodology. Indeed, a testament to its expansive nature is the Venetian ship etched into the columns on the west facade of the prison cells of the Palazzo Ducale (134–137). The Venetian ship catalogue is clear, despite the technical nomenclature, and a helpful glossary at the end), and each work is illustrated.

Andalus, from Ibn Hazm (Eric Ormsby), whose books
us after his death, but whom later Spanish readers like
exically embraced as a "Muslim Don Quixote" (248), to
es María Álvarez), the Andalusian Jew converted to
nately promoted Arabic science, to the Sufi writer Ibn
sh), not to mention the intriguingly complex Majorcan
I (Gregory B. Stone).

Sicily," is an examination of the spirit of Arabic culture
the island had been captured by Christian armies. In
ot and the Translators," Thomas E. Burman looks at the
ation as a vehicle that transferred Arabic culture to the
lens of the fascinating figure of the medieval translator
own by posterity for being condemned to the circle of
Inferno (Canto XX), Scot established his name as a
Toledo at the beginning of the thirteenth century and
the Sicilian court of Frederick II, where he found en-
ough known for translations of alchemical and magical
is place in Dante's Hell, Scot was also instrumental in
Aristotle's writings available to Western readers. Chapter
man Courts," describes how, according to Karla Mal-
d Islamic ideas of government and Arabic culture with

and Exiles," profiles Andalusian culture in reference to
way by a resistance to the dominant society surround-
s" by Hanna E. Kassis, "The Arabized Jews" by Ross
y Luce López-Baralt), or those defined by the nostal-
"The Sephardim" by Samuel G. Armistead). This last
f the greatest living experts on Sephardic ballad tradi-
on all the way down to the eighteenth century. Ar-
riod as "the Golden Age of Judeo-Spanish literature"
reader to the remarkable wealth of non-Hispanic in-
ardic oral literature in exile.

art VI, "To Al-Andalus, Would She Return the Greet-
ly essay, but rather an English translation by Michael
m in N) of Ibn Zaydūn, which communicates the sen-
that Muslims must have felt at the waning and defeat
ok explores.

o be made regarding this volume, it is that the editors
ement of the chapters so as to avoid compartmental-
tifacted topic, a choice that may be disconcerting to
ume for the first time. That said, the bibliographies
ach chapter are extremely valuable and will aid the
d in further investigations on each topic. Due to this
erits of the essays in this collection, scholars in fields

indicate British origin, the chapter's author tells us that
as a mystery.

that in some way deal with the culture of Islamic Iberia will find *The Literature of Al-Andalus* to be very helpful as a reference work for understanding a subject that is significant, albeit little-known outside the circle of the cognoscenti.

DAMIAN BACICH, Spanish and Portuguese, UCLA

Lillian Ray Martin, *The Art and Archaeology of Venetian Ships and Boats* (College Station, TX: Texas A&M University Press 2001) xii + 236 pp., 153 b/w ill.

In this wonderfully illustrated volume, the fifth in a series of Studies in Nautical Archaeology, Lillian Ray Martin presents the most extensive catalogue to date of all known medieval and Renaissance representations of ships and boats in and around the Veneto. Over the course of three chapters composed of an introductory essay, the catalogue, and an analysis of the collected works, the author answers a range of archaeological questions regarding the function and design of Venetian watercraft. This is a particularly welcome study from this reviewer's point of view, because although it is by no means the first technical study of early modern Venetian ships, as the author makes clear by citing the fundamental work of Giovanni Casoni (1847), Frederic Lane (1934, 1963, 1973), Marco Bonino (1978), and Alvise Chiggiato (1987, 1989), it is the first archaeological work that utilizes a wealth of visual evidence to bring their rigging, steering mechanisms, and superstructure into focus.

Martin devotes the first chapter to an introduction of Venetian history and art. This opening chapter is divided into subheadings that include a chronological summary of significant political events and nautical developments, as well as an overview of Venetian art and a discussion of its prevailing iconographic themes. Of particular interest is the discussion of the navigational instruments that were invented between 1250 and 1300, such as the magnetic compass and the pulley, which increased Venetian trade activity in the Mediterranean by allowing for faster and safer shipping. It should be noted, however, that while some of these sections are clearly meant to acquaint the reader with various aspects of Venetian history, others have a more uncertain purpose. One section devoted to artistic techniques, for example, does not appear to be relevant. It is only when one nearly finishes the book that one realizes it was intended to describe the artistic techniques employed to produce the works illustrated in the catalogue. It is never explicitly stated. As a result, this first chapter reads as a somewhat disjointed assemblage of topics unrelated to each other and to what comes later.

The primary contribution of this book lies in the catalogue of the second chapter, where Martin has pulled together 129 artistic representations of Venetian ships and boats drawn from the early fourth to the early sixteenth centuries. Compiled from mosaics, enamels, wood inlays, manuscript illuminations, frescoes, paintings, sculpture, prints and engravings, and metalwork, the catalogue demonstrates the author's meticulous method and is exhaustive in scope. Indeed, a testament to its expansive nature is the inclusion of the *graffiti* of ships etched into the columns on the west facade of San Marco and in the prison cells of the Palazzo Ducale (134-137). The information given in the catalogue is clear, despite the technical nomenclature used throughout (there is a helpful glossary at the end), and each work is illustrated and accompanied by