Journal of Islamic Studies, Volume 12, Issue 3, pp. 336-340: Abstract.

The Literature of Al-Andalus Edited by MARíA ROSA MENOCAL, RAYMOND P. SCHEINDLIN, and MICHAEL SELLS (in The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 516 pp. Price HB £90.00. ISBN 0-521-47159-1.

L. P. Harvey

Oxford Centre for Islamic Studies

Full-Text PDF (54 KB)

Franks that existed in the Near East. Hillenbrand draws extensively on the contemporary works of Usāma ibn Munqidh and Ibn Jubayr for their insightful and nearly always entertaining perspectives on the Franks. She also incorporates considerable amounts of poetry, folk literature, chronicles, and theological texts to examine Muslim attitudes towards Frankish religion and defilement of Islamic space, as well as Muslim attitudes towards Frankish politics, hygiene, sexual laxity, filth, contamination, bizarre medical practices, etc. Her nuanced discussion of the effect of the Frankish presence on Muslim attitudes and actions toward the local eastern Christian population is particularly informative.

Chapters Seven ('Armies, Arms, Armour and Fortifications') and Eight ('The Conduct of War') are extended treatments of the nuts and bolts of warfare. Employing art, artefacts, fortifications, military manuals, and historical accounts, Hillenbrand paints vivid pictures of land battles, sieges of fortifications, and naval encounters as she presents a detailed analysis of how warfare was conducted by the Muslim warriors of the period.

Chapter Nine ('Epilogue: The Heritage of the Crusades') is a terse and admittedly incomplete discussion of modern Muslim perceptions of the Crusades. It focuses on modern issues and themes that, as one might expect, tend to be anachronistic in the extreme and are exploited by their proponents for political and religious ends that have little to do with the events of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. As such, it is not entirely clear why this essay was appended as an epilogue to this fine study. But this is a mere quibble. *The Crusades: Islamic Perspectives* is a masterly and welcome contribution to the historiography of the Crusades. Hillenbrand has set an enviable standard of scholarship from which teachers and students of the Crusades, the medieval Middle East, and medieval Europe will long benefit.

James E. Lindsay
Colorado State University

The Literature of Al-Andalus

Edited by María Rosa Menocal, Raymond P. Scheindlin, and Michael Sells (in The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 516 pp. Price HB £90.00. ISBN 0–521–47159–1.

The volumes of *The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature* that have appeared already have each covered a broad enough sweep (for example *Arabic Literature to the End of the Umayyad Period* or *Modern Arabic Literature*), but none has attempted to take in quite such as diverse a range of writings as this volume. Its coverage stretches from when Arabic began to be written in the Iberian Peninsula (after the invasion of 711) to the end in the period of the Moriscos (and they are followed into their post-expulsion (1611) North African exile). The time span is therefore nearly a millennium. It might be thought that its geographical concentration—on the Iberian

Peninsula—would in some way compensate for the difficulties created by the length of the period under consideration. However, the editors' decision—entirely correct in my opinion—also to provide treatment of some aspects of the culture of the two *dhimmī* communities of al-Andalus (Christians and Jews) means in fact that space is at a premium, and the editors have done well to pack in as much as they have. And since Part IV of the six into which the volume is divided is headed 'To Sicily', we have into the bargain further sections on 'Poetries of the Norman Courts' and on Ibn Ḥamdīs. (Puzzlingly, a brief two-page note on 'The Dual Heritage in Sicilian Monuments' by D. F. Ruggles of Cornell appears at the end of Part III, under the heading 'Andalusians'.) As for languages of the texts under consideration, this is part of a History of Arabic Literature, and most of its chapters are indeed based on works written in Arabic by Muslims, but, as we will see, it also takes in some authors who wrote in Hebrew, Latin, and various forms of Romance.

There are important studies of Jewish authors from Islamic Spain whose Arabic-language works were in general disseminated in Hebrew-character manuscripts (Moses Ibn Ezra, Judah Halevi) and some of writings straightforwardly in Hebrew. Tova Rosen's study of the *muwashshaḥ* is much to be praised in this connection, for one of the literary high points of Andalusī Arabic poetry is to be found in this form of strophic composition. Because Hebrew poets calqued their literary productions in Hebrew so closely on literary fashions first launched in Arabic, a great deal about the Arabic models is to be learned from analysis of this derivative literature. Nor was the intertwining of the two cultures limited to *belles lettres*. As Eric Ormsby makes clear in his chapter, a Muslim thinker of the eminence of Ibn Ḥazm was aware of the work of some of the great Jewish scholars of al-Andalus. A book such as this, which aims at providing a coherent discussion of the literature of al-Andalus as it existed as a functioning whole, does well not to exclude this Jewish material.

Samuel G. Armistead's chapter, 'The Sephardim', is largely concerned with what happened after the expulsion of Jews from Spain in 1492. As he points out, their ballad literature (in Spanish) may well allude to 'happenings in the Balkans and the Near East ... also Morocco.' Can the inclusion of such material in a History of Arabic Literature be justified? Armistead argues: 'one of the most striking instances of the medieval character of the Judeo-Spanish traditional ballads' is the way they continue to recall 'the trireligious Iberian society' they had left behind them when they began 'their multisecular peregrination through the Mediterranean lands and beyond'. In other words, to include these works is justified because they preserve evidence of the living reality of the pluralist Andalusī society: Muslims, Christians, and Jews together.

Even more dubious, perhaps, is the inclusion of some aspects of the Christian literatures of the Iberian Peninsula in Latin and the Romance vernaculars: there are chapters on Petrus Alfonsi (a Jewish convert to Christianity, of course), Michael Scot and the translators, and Ramón Llull. Here we are dealing with authors whom many of their Muslim

contemporaries would have been unaware of. In the strictest interpretation of the term, they do not form an integral part of 'the literature of al-Andalus' in the way that the Jewish authors do, even though the authors mentioned were active in the Iberian peninsula. However, readers of this volume, or most of them at least, will presumably be interested in the channels through which Islamic culture eventually passed over to the Latin West, and so will be grateful for what are authoritative surveys of work in fields where studies have progressed rapidly in recent years.

Gregory B. Stone contributes a thought-provoking study of Ramón Llull. The greater part of the *opus* of this important author is, of course, in Latin and in Catalan, but he learnt Arabic well enough to write books in the language. In order to have a teacher always available, Llull bought himself an Arabic-speaking slave. Stone does tell the infinitely sad story of the suicide of this man (driven to despair by the physical ill-treatment he had been receiving), yet some of Stone's comments I find an inadequate response: 'Ramón's violence against the Muslim is not so much an anecdote from Llull's biography as it is a metaphor for two centuries of military crusades waged by the West against the Near East.' And again, 'The Muslim's suicide is the symbolic wish-fulfilment of Llull's lifelong dream. Llull did not aim to destroy Islam, rather he wished that it would destroy itself.' For me such finely spun metaphors and ingeniously interpreted symbols are quite eclipsed by the concrete reality of the slave's corpse dangling on a rope.

The books and documents in Arabic that have come down to us from the Mozarabic community (the Arabized Christians living under Muslim rule, some of whom at one stage migrated into the Romance-speaking Christian north, where they long retained elements of their 'Arabized' identity) certainly deserve a place in this volume. In an introductory section, H. D. Miller characterizes their culture as polymorphous and hybrid. In the main section, Hanna Kassis (of the University of British Columbia) does a splendid job of assembling scattered and disparate material, making this an important contribution. Towards the end of the chapter Kassis also makes a brief reference to the ostensibly Christian scriptures written in Arabic, which were forged in Granada in the late sixteenth century. I note what is obviously a slip of the pen at this point: Kassis clearly meant to say that it was 'not until the middle of the *seventeenth* century that Rome finally declared' this material to be a forgery (p. 431).

Such breadth of coverage must be bought at a price. This is not the sort of manual that endeavours at least to list briefly all known authors. The chapters on Arabic authors perforce only cover a selection of outstanding figures: there are chapters on Ibn Zaydūn, Ibn Ṭufayl, Ibn 'Arabī, Ibn al-Khaṭīb, etc. Concentration on representative major figures makes for clarity of presentation; obviously gaps have had to be left. Again, I think the editorial decision not to inundate us in the names of lesser authors was correct, though I would add that this type of presentation makes it very desirable to provide good cross-referencing. Unfortunately the restricted (eleven-page) index often leaves the reader disappointed.

Having just alluded to the problems arising from the inclusion of material on the various minority communities, I may appear unreasonable if I now go on to regret the absence of any treatment of the Berber contribution to the civilization of al-Andalus. From the disappearance of the Western Caliphate until 1492, Berber interventions propped up in various ways (and not merely militarily) a political entity that might well have collapsed earlier if left unaided. Yet Berbers are usually ignored, or portrayed as mere negative and destructive elements, or cultural nullities. This obscures the fact that it was at the courts of various Berber princes that the flowering of Andalusī philosophical thought took place. And they were the patrons of the poets who created the *muwashshaḥ* and the *zajal*, perhaps the most highly regarded of the contributions al-Andalus made to Arabic literature as a whole.

The main body of this collection of studies is brought to a close by Luce López-Baralt's survey of the writings of the Moriscos. (The book itself closes with a final flourish: a translation of the *Nuniyya* of Ibn Zaydūn.) The adaptation of the Arabic alphabet by the Moriscos to write their basically Romance dialects permitted these persecuted folk to create a clandestine literature in which they could preserve their Islamic identity. López-Baralt conveys very well the stresses and strains engendered by the covert nature of this culture. Her decision to follow the Moriscos into their North African exile opens the way to discussion of the works created by the exile communities. And amongst these is a text she has recently published from a manuscript now in the Royal Academy of History in Madrid under the title *A Spanish Kama Sutra* (*Un Kama Sutra español*). Elsewhere I have already questioned the wisdom of imposing on a text that is really a quite orthodox presentation of Islamic teachings on marriage such an un-Islamic title, which is entirely her own creation. The text in question certainly deals straightforwardly and without reticence with sexual relations within matrimony, but it owes nothing to any Hindu manual. She makes the very valid point that such teaching on 'prayerful sexual union is unimaginable in Christian tradition' (p. 478 citing St Augustine and Aquinas). López-Baralt makes it quite clear that her text was written about 1630, when the author was already a refugee in Tunisia. Some readers may wish to draw the conclusion that such material would have been in circulation in the Peninsula before the Expulsion, but the evidence pointing in that direction is weak.

Of this final North African stage in the long history of the literature of al-Andalus, what we might style its refugee phase, the best-known work up to the present has been the long poem written by Mohamed Rabadán, in Aragonese, titled *Discurso de la luz y descendencia y linaje claro de nuestro ... profeta Mohamed* that might perhaps have merited a mention. López-Baralt does well to draw attention to the cultural complexity underlying the writings of these exiles (who preserved a taste for such Spanish authors as Garcilaso, Góngora, and Quevedo), but Rabadán's devotional poetry would have served to remind us of the predominant feature of Morisco culture: a determination to cling on to orthodoxy at all costs.

With all three editors from US institutions, and with most of the array of well-qualified specialist contributors American or based in North America, one might have expected the task of ensuring some degree of evenness in style and presentation to have been facilitated. Some contributors have clearly given careful thought to the problems of communication posed by their difficult subject matter, and have succeeded very well. In this connection one might mention López-Morillas (on 'Language'), Rosen (on the *muwashshaḥ*), Drory (on the *maqāma*), Ormsby (on Ibn Ḥazm), Goodman (on Ibn Ṭufayl—an admirably clear essay), and Granara (on 'Ibn Ḥamdīs and the Poetry of Nostalgia'), but there are some contributions that would have benefited from more rigorous editorial attention. For example when Amila Butorovic, writing on Ibn Quzmān, remarks—with some perspicacity—on the poet's successful escape from the archetypes of love poetry, thus creating 'a distinctive poetic diction'; she goes on to say that 'The aftermath is a poetry fraught with images conveyed through various literary figures.' Neither *aftermath* nor *fraught* can be what she means. The same goes for 'Hurrah, drunkards, for the sake of the Prophet, gang!' (number 136). An editor should have offered alternatives and, might one add, Cambridge University Press should itself have raised queries. What is the point of lavishing care on the printing and layout of a book (and this volume is very nicely produced indeed), but not taking care with the actual words?

To sum up: the editors have done well to present something of the diversity of the literatures of al-Andalus. We have hitherto been given a flat and two-dimensional image of what was a complex and multifaceted reality; yet it might well be argued that too much space has been allocated here to the minority communities, and it would be easy to draw up a list of authors of some merit from the majority who are ignored. Nevertheless, this volume is an important step towards a better understanding of the culture of al-Andalus as a whole, and is to be welcomed.

L. P. Harvey
Oxford Centre for Islamic Studies

Ibn Khaldun and the Medieval Maghrib

By MICHAEL BRETT (Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing, 1999), 312 pp. Price HB £57.50. ISBN 0–86078–772–9.

We have every reason to be grateful for collections such as this, which assembles for us fifteen items published between 1969 and 1999 in a variety of places. To track them all down in a library might well be a time-consuming task. Brett, in his Introduction, says of them, 'all the articles reprinted here are either explicitly or implicitly revisionist. ... They are concerned with the twin themes of Islamisation and Arabisation; and they refer to Ibn Khaldun as a source of information and interpretation.' He does not arrange the articles in chronological order, but thematically under the three headings of 'Islam and State' (chapters I–VII); 'The Banu Hilal' (chapters VIII–XI), and 'Cities'